

APPLICATION FOR DIRECTIONS HEARING OR ORDERS

Use this form if you have a VCAT case in progress and want:

- directions about how the case should be managed for example, whether other parties can join the proceeding
- an injunction an order that directs someone to do (or not do) something
- an interlocutory order these are proceedings for dealing with a specific issue in a matter until a final hearing and decision
- an order for costs if final orders have been made.

For a planning and environment directions or practice day hearing, use the Practice Day Request form.

FEES

You must pay a fee with this application if you are:

- seeking an injunction in the Civil Division
- applying for costs after a final hearing in VC AT's Administrative, Civil or Planning and Environment Division.

For information about fees, visit www.vcat.vic.gov.au/fees

LODGING THIS FORM

You must send a copy to:

- all parties when you send this application to VCAT, so everyone can prepare if a hearing is scheduled at short notice
- any proposed parties, if this is an application to join a current case as a party.

File and serve copies of all documentation in support of the application:

- urgent applications by noon one business day before the directions hearing
- routine applications by noon four business days before the directions hearing. Answering material must be filed and served by noon two business days before the directions hearing.

You may have to pay costs if a hearing is adjourned (delayed) because you did not file and serve documents as required.

Complete all fields on this form. Incomplete forms can delay processing and the application may be rejected.

MORE INFORMATION

Read Practice Note - PNVCAT5 Directions Hearings and Urgent Hearings.

You can contact us if you need help to complete this form. Please visit our website vcat.vic.gov.au for contact details.

APPLICATION FOR DIRECTIONS HEARING OR ORDERS

	VCAT reference number
Case details	
Applicant/s	
Respondent/s	
Other/s - for example, represented person, joined party, obj	ector



Details of person making this request
Are you the:
Respondent
Applicant
Other (specify)
Name/company
Contact number
Contact email
Are you represented?
Yes No
If yes, by whom?
Orders sought
I am applying for:
Directions
Injunction (fees apply)
Interlocutory order
Costs application after the final hearing (fees may apply)
Other orders (specify)
Tell us what you want and why: Attach a separate page if required
Is this application urgent?
Yes No
If yes, why?



Orders sought (continued)
Have you told the other parties that you are making this application? Yes No
If no, why not?
If you can, estimate hearing time required:
Date of next hearing: dd / mm / yyyy
Signed: James Kerr
Date: dd / mm / yyyy

IN THE VICTORIAN CIVIL AND ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

Ref: P79/2023

IN THE MATTER OF:

APPLICANT:

Merri-bek City Council

RESPONDENT: Bobsled Properties Pty Ltd (ACN 623 493 256)

AFFIDAVIT

Date of Document: 9 March 2023 Filed on behalf of: the Respondent

Telephone: 9600-2234

Prepared by: Kerr & Kerr Partners Pty Ltd

Level 2, 90 William Street Melbourne VIC 3000

Ref: 1517/18

Solicitors Code: 107900

- I, James Douglas Kerr, of Level 2, 90 William Street, Melbourne, solicitor, affirm and say as follows:
- 1. I am an Australian lawyer and Partner of Kerr and Kerr Partners Pty Ltd (Kerr and Kerr), we are the legal representatives of the Respondent in this matter. I am authorised by the Respondent to make this affidavit on their behalf. I make this affidavit from my own knowledge, information and belief save where otherwise indicated.
- 2. The Respondent seeks to join Owners Corporation Plan No 1 706696X ("OC") to these Proceedings.
- 3. I refer to the Respondent's Statement of Grounds dated 9 March 2023 ("Statement of Grounds").

Wenxuan Yu Now produced and shown to me and marked with the letters "JDK-1" is a true copy of the Statement of Grounds. IV amundlaM An Australian Legal Practitioner

- within the meaning of the 4. It is alleged by the Respondent in the Statement of Grounds that the OC is responsible for the common property and common services in the development.
- 5. I am instructed and believe that the alleged noise issues, the subject of these Proceedings, arise from non-conforming building work located in the common property areas of the development that are the sole responsibility of the OC.
- 6. In order to satisfactorily resolve the matters in dispute, in my view, it is important that the OC is joined to this Proceeding.
- 7. The Respondent has issued proceedings in the Owners Corporation list of VCAT in proceedings OC122/2023 ("OC Proceeding). The OC Proceeding relates to the same facts and circumstances arising in this Proceeding.

Now produced and shown to me and marked with the letters "JDK-2" is a true copy of the application filed in the OC Proceeding.

- 8. In my view, this Proceeding and the OC Proceeding should be heard concurrently, consistent with the Tribunal's obligations under s98 Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal Act 1998, namely that in hearing the matters concurrently, it would:
 - (a) determine the proceedings with as little formality and technicality and with as much speed as the requirements of the *Planning and Environment Act 1987* and the *Owners Corporations Act 2006* require;
 - (b) ensure that the Tribunal has a proper consideration of the matters before it; and,
 - (c) limit the costs of the parties involved in proceedings that rely upon the same facts ands circumstances.

The contents of this affidavit are true and correct and I make it knowing that a person making a false affidavit may be prosecuted for the offence of perjury.

Affirmed by the said **JAMES DOUGLAS KERR**) at Melbourne) in the State of Victoria) on 9 March 2023

This affidavit was sworn by the deponent via an audio-visual link, and the authorised affidavit taker had used a scanned copy of the affidavit and not the original in accordance with the Oaths and Affirmations Act 2018

Before me:

WENXUAN YU

Wenxuan Yu

Level 2, 90 William Street
Melboume VIC 3000
An Australian Legal Practitioner
within the meaning of the
Legal Profession Uniform Law (Victoria)

LEVEL 2, 90 WILLIAM STREET, MELBOURNE VIC 3000

AN Australian legal practitioner within the meaning the Legal Profession Uniform Law (Victoria)

IN THE VICTORIAN CIVIL AND ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

Ref: P79/2023

IN THE MATTER OF:

APPLICANT:

Merri-bek City Council

RESPONDENT: Bobsled Properties Pty Ltd (ACN 623 493 256)

AFFIDAVIT CERTIFICATE IDENTIFYING EXHIBIT

Date of Document: 9 March 2023 Filed on behalf of: the Respondent

Prepared by: Kerr & Kerr Partners Pty Ltd

Level 2, 90 William Street Melbourne VIC 3000

Solicitors Code: 107900 Telephone: 9600-2234

Ref: 1517/18

This is the exhibit marked "JDK-1" now produced and shown to JAMES DOUGLAS KERR at the time of affirming this affidavit on 9 March 2023.

BEFORE ME....

Wenxuan Yu

Level 2, 90 William Street Melbourne VIC 3000 An Australian Legal Practitioner within the meaning of the Legal Profession Uniform Law (Victoria)

WENXUAN YU

LEVEL 2, 90 WILLIAM STREET, MELBOURNE VIC 3000

AN Australian legal practitioner within the meaning the Legal Profession Uniform Law (Victoria)

Statement of Grounds dated 9 March 2023



STATEMENT OF GROUNDS

Use this form to set out your reasons for contesting a planning other than an enforcement case at VCAT. These written reasons are called your Statement of Grounds.

VCAT		unds must be recei				
	•	red or the sign at the		9/	03/2023	
		received by VCAT a party to the case.	arter this			
2. VCAT Refere		P79/2023				
Number and Sit	e Address	1/294 Lygon Stre	et			
VHO IS MAKING	THIS STATE	EMENT OF GROUN	NDS?			
. Who is making t	his Statemen	t of Grounds?				
A company						
. Full name of the	person, com	pany, authority or o	ther maki	ng this S	tatement of	Ground
BOBSLED PRO	PERTIES PT	/ LTD				
. Are you?						
		-l - 6 Al U Al		Torder	-	
೦೦೦೩ Owants to hearing to Statemen	a person who object, you are o be considere it of Grounds,	did not object to the not a formal party to d to be added as a formal party to d to be added as a formal person	original ap the VCAT ormal party	plication case and . You also	d you must at o must subm	ttend the it your o
NOTE: If you are	a person who object, you are o be considere it of Grounds,	did not object to the not a formal party to d to be added as a fo separate to a person	original ap the VCAT ormal party	plication case and . You also	d you must at o must subm	ttend the it your o
NOTE: If you are come to wants to wants to statement of the council.	a person who object, you are o be considere it of Grounds,	did not object to the not a formal party to d to be added as a fo separate to a person	original ap the VCAT ormal party	plication case and . You also	d you must at o must subm	ttend the it your o
NOTE: If you are wants to wants to hearing to Statement Council.	a person who object, you are o be considere it of Grounds, s ther, please sp	did not object to the not a formal party to d to be added as a foseparate to a person ecify below	original ap the VCAT ormal party who objec	pplication case and You also ted to the	d you must a o must subm original app	ttend the
NOTE: If you are wants to wants to hearing to Statement () was a Council. If you selected of the council of th	a person who object, you are o be considere it of Grounds, s ther, please sp	did not object to the not a formal party to d to be added as a fo separate to a person	original ap the VCAT ormal party who objec	pplication case and You also ted to the	d you must a o must subm original app	ttend the
NOTE: If you are wants to wants to wants to selected of the se	a person who object, you are o be considere it of Grounds, ther, please sp be identified a	did not object to the not a formal party to d to be added as a foseparate to a person ecify below	original aports of the VCAT ormal party who object of the volume of the vith you. It	oplication case and You also ted to the	d you must and must submeter original appoint of the submeter	ttend the it your o lication to lication t
NOTE: If you are wants to wants to wants to wants to selected of the selected	a person who object, you are o be considere it of Grounds, ther, please sp be identified a	did not object to the not a formal party to d to be added as a formal person ecify below se a person of Abortuses to correspond will send all our notice.	original aports of the VCAT ormal party who object of the volume of the vith you. It	oplication case and You also ted to the	d you must and must submeter original appoint of the submeter	ttend the it your or lication t
NOTE: If you are wants to wants to statement of the state	da person who object, you are to be considered to Grounds, states, please specified a dress?	did not object to the not a formal party to d to be added as a formal person ecify below as a person of Abortouses to correspond will send all our notice ONS ROAD	original aports of the VCAT ormal party who object of the volume of the vith you. It	oplication case and You also ted to the	d you must and must submeter original appoint of the submeter	ttend the it your or lication t
NOTE: If you are wants to wants to hearing to Statemer Council. If you selected of No No What is your add This will be the a you have a representation of the statement of th	da person who object, you are to be considered to f Grounds, state of Grounds, state	did not object to the not a formal party to d to be added as a formal person ecify below as a person of Abortouses to correspond will send all our notice ONS ROAD	original aports the VCAT ormal party who object iginal and with you. It es to your	oplication case and you also ted to the	d you must at a must subme original app	ttend the it your ou lication to lication

9. Details of your representative:

Organisation name (if applicable)		KERR & KERR P	PARTNE	RS			
Full name of representative		JAMES DOUGLA	JAMES DOUGLAS KERR				
Street address LEVEL 2, 90 WIL			LIAM STREET				
Suburb	MEL	BOURNE		State	VIC	Postcode	3000
Phone number 03 9600 2234							
Email		james@kerrpartne	ers.com.au				

IS THIS A JOINT STATEMENT OF GROUNDS?

10. Complete this section if you are a spokesperson for people lodging a joint Statement of Grounds. We will only communicate with the nominated representative for a joint Statement of Grounds.

Use the + Add Joint Respondent button to enter the details of each person you represent. Also, attach a list of their names and addresses demonstrating the consent of each person with their signature. You can do this at the bottom of this form.

I certify that I have consent to act as a spokesperson for the attached list of people where this is a joint Statement of Grounds

No

WHAT GROUNDS TO YOU RELY UPON?

11a. State your grounds

Victorian Civil & Administrative Tribunal Planning and Environment Division Planning and Environment List VCAT Reference No: P79/2023

MERRI-BEK CITY COUNCIL Applicant

BOBSLED PROPERTIES PTY LTD Respondent

STATEMENT OF GROUNDS

The Respondent will rely upon the following statement of grounds:

- 1. The Respondent admits paragraphs 1 to 7 of Annexure A to the Applicant's application to the Tribunal dated 19 January 2023 (application).
- 2. The Respondent is the owner of lot G01 (Lot) in a development otherwise known as 294 Lygon St Brunswick East 3057 (development).
- 3. The Land is described in Certificate of Title Volume 11993 Folio 725 and more particularly as Lot G01 on Plan of Subdivision 706696X (plan of subdivision).

- 4. The plan of subdivision describes the extent of the Lot as being defined by the structure of the development, specifically:
- (a) the interior face of all floors, ceilings and walls in the Lot;
- (b) the upper face of the concrete floor slab in the Lot; and
- (c) the underside of the suspended ceiling; (Lot boundaries).
- 5. The common property on the plan of subdivision includes:
- (a) all the land in the plan of subdivision except the Lot and other lots and includes the structure of all walls, floors and ceilings which define boundaries; and
- (b) all internal columns, service ducts, pipe shafts, cable ducts and vents within the building (common property).
- 6. Within the Lot boundaries, there are four internal columns, service ducts, pipe shafts, cable ducts and vents (common services).
- 7. The Owners Corporation search report shows that:
- (a) there are 37 other lots on the land (other lots);
- (b) the Lot, the other lots and the common property are all affected by one owners corporation, namely Owners Corporation 1 Plan No PS706696X (OC);
- (c) the OC is an unlimited owners corporation; and
- (d) owners corporation rules AR562304X dated 17 October 2018 (rules) apply to the operation of the OC.
- 8. On 16 December 2022, the Applicant obtained an expert acoustic report from Acoustic Dynamics (AD Report).
- 9. The AD Report identified:
- (a) alleged noise breaches in the rear bedroom of Apartment 108 on the first floor of the development and the bedroom of Apartment 306 on the third floor of the development (bedrooms):
- (b) the transmission path for the music noise intrusion could be localised to the southern wall/floor junction of both bedrooms; (alleged noise breaches).
- 10. Further, the AD Report stated that:
- (a) no music noise could be identified as being transmitted via the façade windows;
- (b) the expert had not inspected the Piano Bar, nor the construction separating the venue from the apartments above; and
- (c) the expert could not fully investigate potential transmission paths and conclusively define how the music noise is being transmitted into the apartments.
- 11. There are service ducts located proximate to the southern wall/floor junctions of both bedrooms (service ducts). There are common services located in each of those service ducts.
- 12. The service ducts and common services within them are common property, having regard to the plan of subdivision. The service ducts and the common property services found within them are common property areas on the land. The OC is wholly responsible for them.
- 13. It was a building requirement that all common services in the service ducts and ceiling spaces be acoustically lagged.
- 14. The Respondent says that the common services:
- (a) found within the Lot, were not acoustically lagged when the Respondent took possession of the Lot;
- (b) that penetrate the walls of the Lot from common property areas have not been acoustically sealed:
- (c) located adjacent to the Lot above various storage cages in common property areas on the ground floor of the development are not acoustically lagged;
- (d) given the above, the service ducts adjacent to the bedrooms are not likely to have been

acoustically lagg	ea.
15. The Respondent in a	dent says that the noise issue has arisen due to the common services within the common property areas not having been acoustically lagged or treated.
16. By reason of by the Applicant	the above, the Respondent says that the party responsible for the breach alleged is the OC.
	dent has undertaken significant works to the Lot to ensure compliance with the ermit conditions, with further particulars to be provided.
18. For the reason of the permit.	ons stated above, the Respondent denies that it has breached conditions 7 and 8
9 March 2023	
Ţ.	
T S Pikusa	
·	
11b. Is this an a	mendment to your existing statement of grounds (where you indicated you e hearing) previously filed with VCAT?
No	
YOUR PARTICI	PATION IN HEARINGS
	PATION IN HEARINGS ding to participate in the hearing? If No, skip to Question 16.
12. Are you inten	
12. Are you inten NOTE: If you corres If you	ding to participate in the hearing? If No, skip to Question 16. select YES, you will be a party and a fee applies. VCAT will send you further
NOTE: If you corres If you corres	ding to participate in the hearing? If No, skip to Question 16. select YES, you will be a party and a fee applies. VCAT will send you further pondence and orders. select NO, you will not be a party and no fee applies. VCAT will not send you further
NOTE: If you corres If you corres Yes, I intend	ding to participate in the hearing? If No, skip to Question 16. select YES, you will be a party and a fee applies. VCAT will send you further pondence and orders. select NO, you will not be a party and no fee applies. VCAT will not send you further pondence and orders.
NOTE: If you corres If you corres Yes, I intend 13. How much tie Estimate the call.	ding to participate in the hearing? If No, skip to Question 16. select YES, you will be a party and a fee applies. VCAT will send you further pondence and orders. select NO, you will not be a party and no fee applies. VCAT will not send you further pondence and orders. It to appear and present a submission at the hearing me will you need to present your entire case at a hearing?
NOTE: If you corres If you corres Yes, I intend 13. How much till Estimate the scall. 10.00 ho	ding to participate in the hearing? If No, skip to Question 16. select YES, you will be a party and a fee applies. VCAT will send you further pondence and orders. select NO, you will not be a party and no fee applies. VCAT will not send you further pondence and orders. It to appear and present a submission at the hearing me will you need to present your entire case at a hearing? time you need to present, including time needed by any expert witnesses you will ours minutes
NOTE: If you corres If you corres Yes, I intend 13. How much till Estimate the scall. 10.00 ho	ding to participate in the hearing? If No, skip to Question 16. select YES, you will be a party and a fee applies. VCAT will send you further pondence and orders. select NO, you will not be a party and no fee applies. VCAT will not send you further pondence and orders. It to appear and present a submission at the hearing me will you need to present your entire case at a hearing? time you need to present, including time needed by any expert witnesses you will
NOTE: If you corres If you corres Yes, I intend 13. How much till Estimate the scall. 10.00 ho 14. How many ex	ding to participate in the hearing? If No, skip to Question 16. select YES, you will be a party and a fee applies. VCAT will send you further pondence and orders. select NO, you will not be a party and no fee applies. VCAT will not send you further pondence and orders. It to appear and present a submission at the hearing me will you need to present your entire case at a hearing? time you need to present, including time needed by any expert witnesses you will ours minutes spert witnesses will you call?
NOTE: If you corres If you corres Yes, I intend 13. How much timestimate the stall. 10.00 how 14. How many examples 2	ding to participate in the hearing? If No, skip to Question 16. select YES, you will be a party and a fee applies. VCAT will send you further pondence and orders. select NO, you will not be a party and no fee applies. VCAT will not send you further pondence and orders. It to appear and present a submission at the hearing me will you need to present your entire case at a hearing? time you need to present, including time needed by any expert witnesses you will ours minutes
NOTE: If you corres If you corres Yes, I intend 13. How much timestimate the stall. 10.00 how 14. How many examples 2	ding to participate in the hearing? If No, skip to Question 16. select YES, you will be a party and a fee applies. VCAT will send you further pondence and orders. select NO, you will not be a party and no fee applies. VCAT will not send you further pondence and orders. It to appear and present a submission at the hearing me will you need to present your entire case at a hearing? time you need to present, including time needed by any expert witnesses you will ours minutes spert witnesses will you call?
NOTE: If you corres If you corres Yes, I intend 13. How much timestimate the stall. 10.00 how 14. How many examples 2	ding to participate in the hearing? If No, skip to Question 16. select YES, you will be a party and a fee applies. VCAT will send you further pondence and orders. select NO, you will not be a party and no fee applies. VCAT will not send you further pondence and orders. It to appear and present a submission at the hearing me will you need to present your entire case at a hearing? time you need to present, including time needed by any expert witnesses you will ours minutes spert witnesses will you call?
NOTE: If you corres If you corres Yes, I intend 13. How much timestimate the stall. 10.00 how 14. How many examples 2	ding to participate in the hearing? If No, skip to Question 16. select YES, you will be a party and a fee applies. VCAT will send you further pondence and orders. select NO, you will not be a party and no fee applies. VCAT will not send you further pondence and orders. It to appear and present a submission at the hearing me will you need to present your entire case at a hearing? time you need to present, including time needed by any expert witnesses you will ours minutes spert witnesses will you call?

HEARING ASSISTANCE	
We can arrange to have an interpreter for anyone who with disability (e.g. hearing loops).	needs to attend the hearing or assist people
These special arrangements are free.	
16. Do you need an interpreter?	
No	
If yes, tell us who needs an interpreter and in what la	anguage/dialect:
	1
17. Does anyone attending the hearing require any E.g. Hearing loop, wheelchair access, additional at	
No	rangomento for percentar earety.
If yes, tell us who needs any other type of special as	sistance and what they require:
CERTIFICATION	
18. You must send a copy of your Statement of Gro Council by the date that appears in the notice y site. If not, we may not be able to hear your view	ou received including on any sign at the
I certify that I will serve a copy of this Statement of Gro	unds
Date to be served on applicant:	9/03/2023
	0/00/0000
Date to be served on respondent:	9/03/2023
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	
By completing this Statement of Grounds, I understand	and acknowledge that:
oxtimes To the best of my knowledge, all information pro	ovided in this application is true and correct.
☑ It is an offence under section 136 of the Victorial knowingly give false or misleading information to \u2216	
Full name of person completing this form: JAMES	DOUGLAS KERR

ABOUT STATEMENT OF GROUNDS FEE

Date of acknowledgement:

Fees apply if you intend to appear or present a submission at the hearing. If you do not pay the fee at the time of lodging this form, you will not be a formal party and will not be entitled to

9/03/2023

take part, even if you indicated that you wanted to participate. A new fee does not apply if you are filing amended statement of grounds.

You do not have to pay a fee if you are

- a permit applicant or holder,
- · the determining or recommending referral authority,

To find out if you need to pay a Statement of Grounds fee and how much it costs, visit the fees page at www.vcat.vic.gov.au/fees.

FEE CATEGORIES

VCAT fees are charged according to three levels:

- corporate fees for businesses and companies with a turnover of more than \$200,000 in the
 previous financial year, corporate entities and government agencies.
- standard fees for individuals, not-for-profit organisations, and small businesses and companies with a turnover of less than \$200,000 in the previous financial year. Small businesses and companies must provide a current statutory declaration to support this claim.
- concession fees for people who hold the Australian Government Health Care Card. You
 must provide a copy of your card (front and back) with your Statement of Grounds. If more
 than one person is named on the Statement of Grounds, this card needs to be provided for
 each person. We do not accept Pensioner Concession Cards or Department of Veteran
 Affairs health cards.



FEE PAYMENT

Are you any of the following:

- · a party that has opted not to attend hearing
- a responsible authority in a proceeding for a review of a decision of the authority to refuse to grant a permit (Sch 1 Cl 56(2)(a) VCAT Act)
- a responsible authority in a proceeding to extend time within which any development is to be commenced or completed (Sch 1 Cl 56(2)(b) VCAT Act)
- · a permit applicant or holder
- the determining or recommending referral authority
- a person responding to an enforcement order application
- an applicant for a works authority or licence
- a party filing an amended statement of grounds

If Yes, a fee will **NOT** be collected. If No, fee payment is required.

Yes

FEE RELIEF

We can reduce or not charge (waive) a VCAT fee for individuals experiencing financial hardship. Any application to reduce or waive the fee should be made as soon as possible to avoid delays. For more information about fee relief, go to https://www.vcat.vic.gov.au/feerelief

If you are applying for fee relief, complete the Fee Relief form and attach it at the bottom of this form.

Are you applying for fee relief?

N	0

WHAT HAPPENS NEXT

If you have provided your email address, you will shortly receive an email from us with instructions about next steps including how to make payment (if applicable). If you have not provided an email address and payment is required, VCAT will contact you by telephone about making payment.

VCAT will process your Statement of Grounds and/or fee payment.

If you have

- not submitted an original objection with the Council or
- · your Statement of Grounds was submitted after the closing date or
- your fee payment was received after the closing date.

VCAT will provide you with details on how you can become a formal party to the VCAT case. You can then decide if you wish to become a formal party to the VCAT case.

SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS

Attachments to this application:

Title	File Name
Statement of Grounds (WORD FORMAT)	Bobsled Properties Pty Ltd - Statement of Grounds KKP 09032023.docx

Large files

For any file larger than 128MB a sharing link is required.

Please list (by line) the name of each file that is bigger than 128MB followed by the hyperlink.

NEED HELP WITH YOUR STATEMENT OF GROUNDS

If you have any questions about completing this form, contact our Customer Service team:

- email admin@vcat.vic.gov.au
- call 1300 01 8228 (1300 01 VCAT) between 9 am and 4:30 pm Monday to Friday
- go to the Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal, Ground Floor, 55 King Street, Melbourne VIC 3000. We are open Monday to Friday from 8:30 am to 4:30 pm

PRIVACY INFORMATION

For a copy of VCAT's privacy statement, go to www.vcat.vic.gov.au/privacy.

Victorian Civil & Administrative Tribunal Planning and Environment Division Planning and Environment List

VCAT Reference No: P79/2023

MERRI-BEK CITY COUNCIL

Applicant

BOBSLED PROPERTIES

Respondent

STATEMENT OF GROUNDS

The Respondent will rely upon the following statement of grounds:

- 1. The Respondent admits paragraphs 1 to 7 of Annexure A to the Applicant's application to the Tribunal dated 19 January 2023 (application).
- The Respondent is the owner of lot G01 (Lot) in a development otherwise known as
 294 Lygon St Brunswick East 3057 (development).
- 3. The Land is described in Certificate of Title Volume 11993 Folio 725 and more particularly as Lot G01 on Plan of Subdivision 706696X (plan of subdivision).
- 4. The plan of subdivision describes the extent of the Lot as being defined by the structure of the development, specifically:
 - (a) the interior face of all floors, ceilings and walls in the Lot;
 - (b) the upper face of the concrete floor slab in the Lot; and
 - (c) the underside of the suspended ceiling;

(Lot boundaries).

- 5. The common property on the plan of subdivision includes:
 - (a) all the land in the plan of subdivision except the Lot and other lots and includes the structure of all walls, floors and ceilings which define boundaries; and

(b) all internal columns, service ducts, pipe shafts, cable ducts and vents within the building

(common property).

- Within the Lot boundaries, there are four internal columns, service ducts, pipe shafts, cable ducts and vents (common services).
- 7. The Owners Corporation search report shows that:
 - (a) there are 37 other lots on the land (other lots);
 - (b) the Lot, the other lots and the common property are all affected by one owners corporation, namely Owners Corporation 1 Plan No PS706696X (OC);
 - (c) the OC is an unlimited owners corporation; and
 - (d) owners corporation rules AR562304X dated 17 October 2018 (rules) apply to the operation of the OC.
- On 16 December 2022, the Applicant obtained an expert acoustic report from Acoustic Dynamics (AD Report).
- 9. The AD Report identified:
 - (a) alleged noise breaches in the rear bedroom of Apartment 108 on the first floor of the development and the bedroom of Apartment 306 on the third floor of the development (bedrooms);
 - (b) the transmission path for the music noise intrusion could be localised to the southern wall/floor junction of both bedrooms;

(alleged noise breaches).

- 10. Further, the AD Report stated that:1
 - (a) no music noise could be identified as being transmitted via the façade windows;
 - (b) the expert had not inspected the Piano Bar, nor the construction separating the venue from the apartments above; and

At paragraphs 34 and 35.

- (c) the expert could not fully investigate potential transmission paths and conclusively define how the music noise is being transmitted into the apartments.
- 11. There are service ducts located proximate to the southern wall/floor junctions of both bedrooms (service ducts). There are common services located in each of those service ducts.
- 12. The service ducts and common services within them are common property, having regard to the plan of subdivision. The service ducts and the common property services found within them are common property areas on the land. The OC is wholly responsible for them.
- 13. It was a building requirement that all common services in the service ducts and ceiling spaces be acoustically lagged.
- 14. The Respondent says that the common services:
 - (a) found within the Lot, were not acoustically lagged when the Respondent took possession of the Lot;
 - (b) that penetrate the walls of the Lot from common property areas have not been acoustically sealed;
 - located adjacent to the Lot above various storage cages in common property areas on the ground floor of the development are not acoustically lagged;
 - (d) given the above, the service ducts adjacent to the bedrooms are not likely to have been acoustically lagged.
- 15. The Respondent says that the noise issue has arisen due to the common services within the development in common property areas not having been acoustically lagged or treated.
- 16. By reason of the above, the Respondent says that the party responsible for the breach alleged by the Applicant is the OC.
- 17. The Respondent has undertaken significant works to the Lot to ensure compliance with the relevant noise permit conditions, with further particulars to be provided.

18. For the reasons stated above, the Respondent denies that it has breached conditions 7 and 8 of the permit.

9 March 2023

T S Pikusa

IN THE VICTORIAN CIVIL AND ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

Ref: P79/2023

IN THE MATTER OF:

APPLICANT:

Merri-bek City Council

RESPONDENT: Bobsled Properties Pty Ltd (ACN 623 493 256)

AFFIDAVIT CERTIFICATE IDENTIFYING EXHIBIT

Date of Document: 9 March 2023

Filed on behalf of: the Respondent

Prepared by: Kerr & Kerr Partners Pty Ltd

Level 2, 90 William Street Melbourne VIC 3000

Solicitors Code: 107900

Telephone: 9600-2234

Ref: 1517/18

This is the exhibit marked "JDK-2" now produced and shown to JAMES DOUGLAS KERR at the time of affirming this affidavit on 9 March 2023.

BEFORE ME...

Wenxuan Yu

Level 2, 90 William Street Melbourne VIC 3000 An Australian Legal Practitioner within the meaning of the

Legal Profession Uniform Law (Victoria,

WENXUAN YU

LEVEL 2, 90 WILLIAM STREET, MELBOURNE VIC 3000

AN Australian legal practitioner within the meaning the Legal Profession Uniform Law (Victoria)

Owners Corporation List Application dated 6 February 2023

VCAT



APPLICATION TO THE OWNERS CORPORATIONS LIST

PRIVACY STATEMENT

VCAT's privacy policy is available at vcat.vic.gov.au/privacy

GETTING STARTED

Who can make this application?

Owners corporations, lot owners or former lot owners, occupiers or former occupiers, managers or former managers, service companies, company title corporations, shareholders or former shareholders of service companies and mortgagees can make applications about disputes between neighbours affected by the same owners corporation, service company or company title corporation; about behaviour such as noise, car parking, rubbish, use of common property; damage to a lot or common property; creating a hazard; about owners corporation fees and levies; about repairs and maintenance to common property; about how meetings are conducted; about disputes between the owners corporation and its manager, managers' fees and/or performance or clauses in the management contract.

For help completing this application, read the guide at vcat.vic.gov.au/ocguide.

Fields marked with an asterisk (*) must be completed.

۷۱	HICH ACT/S ARE YOU MAKING THIS APPLICATION UNDER!	
1.	Please select at least one Act*: ☐ Owners Corporations Act 2006 Part 6 or Part 11 ☐ Company Titles (Home Units) Act 2013	
	☐ Australian Consumer Law and Fair Trading Act 2012 ☐ Subdivision Act 1988 Part 5	
	Other, please specify in United the Salar Profession United the World Colons	
2.	Are you making this application in response to another VCAT application that has been served on you? (This could be in response to an application in other Lists such as the Building & Property, Residential Tenancies and/or Civil Claims Lists.) Yes No	
	If yes, please enter VCAT reference number*	
3.	Are there any related disputes about a residential tenancies agreement, domestic building contract planning application or another civil claim?	ct,
	☐ Yes ☑ No If yes, please enter VCAT reference number*	
4.	Are you seeking an injunction (an urgent order that directs someone to do or not to do something. There is an additional fee if you are applying for an injunction. ☐ Yes ☑ No)?

CLAIM AND PAY	MEN ⁻	T DETAILS					
5. If you are seekin	g paym	ent of money, how i	much is your cla	aim?			
Enter the amount of your claim).	you are	e claiming in the field	below (or if not c	laimir	ng an amou	ınt enter the a	approximate value
Claim amount	\$300,	000.00					
The amount you owebsite at vcat.vi	claim wi c.gov.a	ll determine the appliculfees.	cation fee payab	le. To	check the	current fee, g	o to the VCAT
PREMISES DET	AILS						
		oremises, lot(s) or un			oject of thi		
☐Service Comp	oany, er	nter ACN*					
☐ Company T	itle Cor	poration, enter ACN*					
Address of prem	nises*	294 Lygon St					
Suburb*		East Brunswick	S	tate*	VIC	Postcode*	3057
6b. Does the perso	n makiı	ng this application re	eside at these p	remi	ses?		
6c. Does the person Yes	n you a	re making this appli No	cation against r	eside	at the pro	emises?	
APPLICANT DET	TAILS						
7. Are you applying	as:						
☑ a lot owner or	former	lot owner of an owner	s corporation				
First name*	Bob	sled Properties Pty Lt	þ	A	CN 623 493	3 256	
a shareholder	or form	er shareholder of a se	ervice company c	or con	npany title	corporation	
an owners cor	poration	n, provide details belo	W	_			
Name*			Registered No	*			
an occupier or	former	occupier of a lot or ur	nit, provide detail	s belo	w	Transfer and the	
First name*			Last name	*			
a service com	pany [a company title cor	poration othe	er con	npany (eg l	Pty Ltd), provi	de details below
Company nam	e*		ACN or ABN	*			
		manager of an owners or unit, provide detai		ovide	details belo	ow .	
First name*			Last name	*			
Company nam	e*		ACN or ABN	V*			
Onther places	nocify						

Do you identify Our Koori Engage	/ as a persor ement Manage	ı of Aboriginal and r can give you cultura	d/or Torres St al support throug	t rait isi ghout yo	andei our cas	r desce :e.	enty	
☐ Yes	☑ No							
9. What is your a	ddress?							
Street address*	Level 12, 99	William St						
Suburb*	Melbourne			State*	VIC		Postcode*	3000
10. How can VCA	T contact yo	ou?						
Name of conta	act person*	James Kerr						
Contact numb	er*	03 9670 8533			Fax			
Email jame:	s@kerrpartne	rs.com.au						
By providing t	us with your e	email, you consent	to VCAT upda	ting you	u abo	ut your	application	by email.
	esented by a	lawyer, manager						
✓ Yes			No, skip to Qu	uestion	13			
12. Provide your	representati	ive's details						
Name of firm	or representa	ative Kerr and Kerr	r Partners Pty	Ltd				
DX address				Re	eferen	ice No.	1517/18	
Street addres	s	Level 2, 90 William	n St					
Suburb		Melbourne		Sta	te VI	С	Postco	de 3000
Name of cont	act person	James Kerr						
Contact numb	oer	03 9670 8533			Fax			
Email		james@kerrpartne	ers.com.au					
SECOND APP	LICANT'S	DETAILS						
If there are more t	than two appl	icants copy this sec	ction, complete	e and a	ttach.			
13. Are you apply	ying as:							
☐ a lot owner	or former lot	owner of an owner	rs corporation	_				
First name*			Last na	ne*				
a sharehold	der or former	shareholder of a se	ervice compan	y or co	mpan	y title c	orporation	
an owners	corporation, p	provide details belo	ow					
Name of o	wners corpora	ation*						
Registered								
🗹 an occupie	er or former o	ccupier of a lot or u		_				
First name	EBH L	easehold Pty Ltd	Last na	me* A	CN 62	24 108 2	225	
a service c	company 🔲	a company title cor	rporation 🔲 o	ther co	mpan	y (eg Pt	y Ltd), prov	ide details below
Company r	name*		ACN or A	BN*				
a manager	or former ma	anager of an owner	s corporation,	provide	e deta	ils belo	w	
☐ the mortga	gee of a lot o	r unit, provide deta	ils below					
First name	*		Last na	me*				
Company r			ACN or A	BN*				
other - plea	ase specify							

14. What is your ad	dress?						
Street address*	Level 12, 99	William St					
Suburb*	Melbourne			State* V	/IC	Postcode*	3000
15. How can VCAT	contact you	?				29	
Name of contact	person*	James Kerr					
Contact number*		03 9670 8533		Fax			
Email james@kerrpartners.co			m.au you consent to VCAT updating you about your application by email.				
		•		•	ut your ap	oplication by	email.
16. Are you represented by a lawyer, manager or other person? ✓ Yes, complete the fields below ☐ No, skip to Question 18 ☐ Not yet, skip to Question 18							
17. Provide your re	presentative	s details					
Name of firm or	representative	Kerr and Ker	r Partners Pty Ltd				
DX address				Referen	ice No.	1517/18	
Street address	Level 2, 90 V	Villiam St					
Suburb	Melbourne			State	/IC	Postcode	3000
Contact person	James Kerr						1-17
Contact number	03 9670 853	3		Fax			
Email	james@kern	partners.com.au					
WHO ARE YOU	MAKING T	HIS APPLICA	ATION AGAINS	ST?			
The respondent is the corporation is the res							ns, the owners
18. Is the responde	•	the manageme	nt company nor ti	ie individi	iai IIIaiia	ger.	
		ner of an owne	rs corporation				
First name*	•		Last name*				
a shareholder	or former sh	areholder of a s	ervice company o	r compan	y title cor	poration	
✓ an owners co	rporation, pro	vide details belo	ow .				
Owners corpo	ration name*	Owners Corp	poration 1				
Registered nu	ımber*	PS706696X					
an occupier o	r former occu	pier of a lot or u	nit, provide details				
First name*			Last name				
☐ a service con	npany ∐ao	company title co	rporation othe	r compan	y (eg Pty	Ltd), provid	e details below
Company nar				CN or AB			
			s corporation, pro	vide deta	ils below		
-	e of a lot or u	nit, provide deta			-		
First name*			Last name	· L			
Company nar ☐ Other - pleas			Α	CN or AB	N*		

19.	If the responIf a companyIf an ownersIf trading und	dent is an individual - provide a street address (PO Box is not sufficient) - provide the address of the Registered Office on the ASIC Company Extract (see page 8) corporation - provide the address of its manager or contact person ler a business name - provide the address for service of document on the ASIC Business it (see page 8)			
	Street address*	161 Park Street			
	Suburb*	South Melbourne State* VIC Postcode* 3205			
	Contact number	(if known) 03 9690 3488 Fax (if known) 03 9699 4581			
	Email	(if known) pernillec@dixonkestles.com.au			
20.	0. Is the respondent represented by a lawyer, manager or other person? ✓ Yes □ No, skip to Question 22 □ Don't know, skip to Question 22				
21.	Provide their re	presentative's details			
	Name of firm or r	epresentative LFS Legal			
	DX address	Reference no. 220425			
	Street address	Suite 3, 242 Toorak Road			
	Suburb	South Yarra State VIC Postcode 3141			
	Contact person	David Free			
	Contact number	03 9826 6400 Fax 03 9826 6606			
	Email	david.free@lfslegal.com.au			
22.	Is there another	respondent you are claiming against? ☑ No, skip to Question 27			
SE	ECOND RESPO	ONDENT'S DETAILS			
If t	here are more tha	n two respondents copy this section, complete and attach to your application.			
23.	. Is the second re	espondent:			
	a lot owner or	former lot owner of an owners corporation			
	First name*	Last name*			
	a shareholder	or former shareholder of a service company or company title corporation			
	an owners co	rporation, provide details below			
	Owners corpora	tion name*			
	Registered num	ber*			
	an occupier o	r former occupier of a lot or unit, provide details below			
	First name*	Last name*			
	a service com	npany			
	Company name	ACN or ABN			
	For other types	of respondents, see the next page.			

a manager or former manager of an owners corporation, provide details below					
☐ the mortgagee	of a lot or ur	nit, provide details belo	pw .		
First name*			Last name*		
Company name*			ACN or ABN*		
other - please	specify				
If the second resp If a company - pro If an owners corpo	ondent is an ovide the add oration - prov business nar	ent's address and co individual - provide a lress of the Registered vide the address of its me - provide the addre	street address (P I Office on the AS manager or conta	SIC Company Extract person	ract (see page 8)
Street address*					
Suburb*			State*	Postcode*	
Contact number			Fax		
Email					
Yes, complete Don't know, sk 26. Provide their re Name of firm or re	ip to Questic	e's details	rst respondent	☐ No, skip to 0	Question 27
DX address			Reference	0.00	
DX address [Kelerenc	e no.	
Street address					
Suburb			State	Postcode	
Contact person		- 3 % 2 %		and the states	
Contact number			Fax		
Email					a - 75 mg ' 15 4 ¹ , 3
APPLICATION D	ETAILS				
27. If the applicant is ✓ No	s an owners	corporation, is there	e a special resol	ution in support	of this application?
28. Is this applicatio ✓ No, skip to Qu		covery of fees?			

29.	Have you followed the procedure in s31 and s32 of the Owners Corporations Act 2006? ☐ No - Your application will be rejected on the grounds that you falled to follow the procedure in section 31 and section 32					
	Yes - Complete both dates below					
	Date of fee notice: (dd/mm/yyyy) / / Date of final notice: (dd/mm/yyyy) / /					
30.	. Is the application about a breach of the Owners Corporations Act, regulations or rules? ☐ No ☑ Yes					
31.	. Has the owners corporation given any notices under Part 10 of the Owners Corporations Act? ☐ No ☑ Yes					
DI	SPUTE DETAILS					
32.	Briefly describe the problem.					
	Be clear and include enough information to enable the respondent to understand the claim.					
	If claiming payment of money, you must include details of each amount claimed.					
	If you do not provide enough information the hearing may be adjourned to allow the respondent to prepare a defence. If the hearing is adjourned you may need to pay a hearing fee for any adjourned hearing. - There have been significant acoustic issues concerning the mixed use building at 280 – 294 Lygon Street, Brunswick East ("Complex").					
	- The Applicants have spent more than \$300,000.00 in undertaking rectification works on their lots in an attempt to address the acoustic issues that have been the subject of numerous complaints from the Respondent, members of the Respondents owners comparation committee and other lot owners in the Complex.					
	- The Applicants instructed Quintas Building & Maintenance Pty Ltd ("Quintas") to inspect a portion of the Complex in a further attempt to identify any other matters that may be contributing to the acoustic issues at the Complex. - The Respondent via their manager was put on notice of new matters concerning unlagged pipes on common property and provided with a copy of the Quintas report dated 18 October 2022 on 8 November 2022 (attached). To date the Respondent has taken no action other than to instruct lawyers who sought time to provide an informed response only to subsequently advise the Applicants lawyer that they held instructions to accept service of proceedings. - The Applicants state that if the first floors underslung sewer and stormwater pipes were acoustically lagged in accordance with the plan (attached) and in accordance with the Building Code of Australia and AS3500 Plumbing and Drainage Water Services standards, this would significantly reduce noise transmission and therefore address the acoustic issues at the Complex. - In light of the above the Applicants seek reimbursement from the Respondent in the amount of \$300,000.00 rectification works					
	to address the acoustic issues as they were to no effect due to the unlagged pipes on common property at the Complex Further, the Applicant seeks an order that the Respondent urgently attends to lagging of the pipes at the Complex, that were identified in the Quintas report The Applicants bring the above claim pursuant to sections 5, 46 and 47 Owners Corporation Act 2006.					
33	. Please tick the order(s) you want VCAT to make.					
00	✓ An order for the payment of money					
	✓ An order that a party to do or not do something					
	An order that a party to comply with the Owners Corporations Act 2006, regulations or rules					
	An order to vary a contract or agreement					
	A declaration about whether a contract or agreement is or is not void					
	A declaration about the meaning of a rule or delegation					
	☐ An order appointing or revoking the appointment of a manager of an owners corporation					
	An order about damaged or destroyed buildings or improvements					
	Order an insurance payment					
	An order about recording the Tribunal's order in the Register kept under the Transfer of Land Act 1958 or require amendment of that Register					
	☐ An order directing a party to comply with the Company Titles (Home Units) Act 2013, a rule of a company title corporation or service company or a term of a service agreement					
	An order appointing an administrator (Division 4)					
	Other - please specify					

HEARING ARRANGEMENTS	
34. Do you or any other person appe	earing at the hearing need special assistance?
Yes, specify what special assist	tance is needed below
☐ Hearing loop ☐ Security	
☐ Interpreter - who needs an inter	preter?
First name	Last name
Language/dialect	
Other, please specify	
SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS	
An extract of the respondent's Obtain a Business Name Extra If the respondent is a compa	idual trading under a business name business name showing the address for service of documents. act at www.asic.gov.au. any bwing the address of the Registered Office of the company.
APPLICATION CHECKLIST	
36. Please ensure you have completed You have attached a recent All or trading under a business na	SIC Company or Business Name Extract (if the respondent is a company
✓ You have paid and attached the paid attached the	ne relevant application fee or you have applied for a fee waiver.
You have made a copy of the	is application for your own records.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	
✓ By ticking this box, I understar	nd and acknowledge that:
	lge, all information provided in this form is true and correct
 it is an offence under section knowingly give false or mis 	on 136 of the <i>Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal Act 1998</i> to sleading information to VCAT.
Date of acknowledgement (dd/mr	m/yyyy): 06 / 02 / 2023



ABOUT VCAT FEES

VCAT fees are charged according to three levels:

- corporate fees for businesses and companies with a turnover of more than \$200,000 in the previous financial year, corporate entities and government agencies
- standard fees for individuals, not-for-profit organisations, and small businesses and companies with a turnover of less than \$200,000 in the previous financial year. Companies must provide a statutory declaration to support
- concession fees for people who hold the Australian Government Health Care Card. You must provide a copy of your card with your application.

To find out more, including how much this application costs, visit www.vcat.vic.gov.au/fees

FEE RELIEF				
We can reduce or not charge (waive) a VC AT fee in certain circumstances.				
Some people are automatically entitled to a full fee waiver. You can also apply for fee relief if paying the fee would cause you financial hardship.				
Visit www.vcat.vic.gov.au/feerelief for more information about fee relief.				
Are you applying for fee relief?				
No No				
Yes - complete Fee relief form and attach it to this application form				
FEE PAYMENT				
Complete this section if you are:				
- applying for an injunction in the Civil Division and not applying for fee relief				
- applying for costs after a final hearing in VCAT's Administrative, Civil or Planning and Environment Division and not applying for fee relief.				
Otherwise there is no fee and you do not have to complete this section.				
Choose the fee level:				
Standard Corporate Concession				
Fee amount charged: \$				
CARD DETAILS				
Cards Accepted: VISA MasterCard				
Cardholder Name:				
Card Number:				
Card Expiry: mm / yy				
Signed:				
Date: dd / mm / yyyy				

REMOVE THIS PAGE WHEN SENDING A COPY OF THIS APPLICATION TO OTHER PARTIES

WHERE TO LODGE THIS APPLICATION

If you have supplied your credit card details, send your completed form to us by post.

If you have not provided your credit card details on this form, you can send your completed form to us by post or email.

To protect yourself, do not send credit card details over email.

By email

Email your completed form to the area in VCAT that is dealing with your case.

Residential Tenancies Division

For cases about:

· Renting a Home

Email: renting@vcat.vic.gov.au

Human Rights Division

For cases about:

- Disability Act
- Equal Opportunity
- · Guardianship and Administration
- Health and Privacy
- Mental Health
- Powers of Attorney

Email: humanrights@vcat.vic.gov.au

Planning and Environment Division

For cases about:

- Land Valuation
- Planning and Environment

Email: admin@vcat.vic.gov.au

By post

VCAT GPO Box 5408 Melbourne VIC 3001

In person

55 King Street Melbourne VIC 3000

Civil Division

For cases about:

- Building and Construction
- Co-owned Land and Goods
- Goods and Services
- Owners Corporations
- Retail and Commercial Leases
- Unreasonable Flow of Water Between Properties

Email: civil@vcat.vic.gov.au

Administrative Division

For cases about:

- Legal Practice
- Review and Regulation

Email: admin@vcat.vic.gov.au